ELECTORAL CONDITIONS IN FEDERALLY ADMINISTERED TRIBAL AREAS OF PAKISTAN
ELECTORAL CONDITIONS IN FEDERALLY ADMINISTERED TRIBAL AREAS OF PAKISTAN
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>FATA MAP</td>
<td>04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</td>
<td>06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. INTRODUCTION</td>
<td>08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. METHODOLOGY</td>
<td>08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. FATA BACKGROUND AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE</td>
<td>08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. FATA’S GENERAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. FATA’S LEGAL ELECTORAL FRAMEWORK</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. THE PRE-ELECTORAL ENVIRONMENT</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. MEDIA AND CIVIL SOCIETY IN FATA</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE LONGER TERM IMPLEMENTATION</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA GLOSSARY</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Pakistan’s upcoming 2013 general elections are of particular importance given the threat to state structures from militant groups with links to the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA). The elections also bear a special significance as they are the first to see political parties in the region allowed to take part and will be taking place against the backdrop of moves towards political mainstreaming of the region. The Federally Administered Tribal Areas present multiple challenges to holding genuine elections in line with Pakistan’s international commitments, amongst them serious governance issues, an unstable security situation and a remote rural population. Conducting elections in such circumstances is extremely difficult. While some significant improvements have been made, insufficient measures have been taken by state agencies to provide for full participation.

This briefing paper is an overview of conditions and challenges in FATA ahead of the 2013 general elections. It was researched using a combination of desk-based reviews, interviews with key stakeholders and field work in FATA, the latter conducted in collaboration with the Free and Fair Election Network, a local NGO.

The population of FATA was given universal franchise in 1996, however, confidence in the process is likely diminished by the absence of a meaningful role for elected representatives in governing FATA, as the territories are federally administered. FATA continues to have a different administrative and judicial structure that is often in conflict with Pakistan’s constitution and human rights commitments.

Elections in FATA are administered by the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP) with substantial support from Political Agents (Pas), senior civil servants of the executive. Due to the lack of separation of powers in FATA, PAs also have judicial authority, compromising the opportunity for independent review and remedy during the election process. Furthermore, access to remedy through the high courts and the Supreme Court is limited for FATA.

Equality of the vote is undermined by the large disparity in constituency sizes. Universal franchise is also compromised by the low number of registrants, particularly women. There are over 1.7 million voters registered in FATA in the final electoral rolls published by the ECP; more than 1.5 million registered in the agencies and, the remainder in the Frontier Regions. Women represent just over a third of registered voters in FATA and the number of men registered is almost double that of women.

Registration for the Computerised National Identity Cards (CNIC), a prerequisite for voter registration, is made more difficult in FATA by a requirement for additional documentation and more stringent verification requirements. The ECP is also not taking action to ensure that people are registered at the correct address. For example, where some ECP offices have not had relevant forms, voters have been asked to download and print the forms themselves (an unreasonable request given lack of electricity and internet access). To date, the ECP and state radio stations have provided insufficient voter education information.

While the security conditions compromise fundamental freedoms of assembly, expression, movement and association, the question is to what extent the state authorities are taking measures to overcome these problems in order to provide maximum opportunity for political parties and electoral activity. Greater voting opportunity, including for women and internally displaced persons, will also require additional measures and resources from state authorities.
SHORT TERM RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Government and ECP should take additional measures to ensure security of candidates, voters, polling staff and ballot papers.

- The Government and ECP should actively support political party and electoral activity that is conducted according to the regulatory framework.

- The ECP and political administration should ensure that women are not deprived of their right to vote and educate female voters informing them of their rights. The ECP should appoint well-trained and competent female returning officers to facilitate women voting in FATA.

- ECP staff working in FATA at all levels to have targeted and on-going training to enhance their professional capacity and ECP infrastructure, resourcing and security provision should be enhanced.

- Additional voter education measures to be undertaken by the ECP, the state radio stations, and civil society to emphasise the importance of voters’ rights and choices.

- The Government should create an enabling environment for journalists covering election processes in FATA and elsewhere.

- A clear system for permission for observation and accreditation should be transparently facilitated, with full support given to observation activities.

- The ECP should develop a plan for facilitation of voting by IDPs. This could include the provision of transportation to polling stations.

LONG TERM RECOMMENDATIONS

- The Constitution may be amended to bring FATA into the national mainstream and extend the jurisdiction superior courts to tribal areas.

- The legal framework should provide for basic human rights including freedoms of assembly, association and expression which are denied under the FCR.

- The same set of electoral laws should apply in FATA as in the rest of Pakistan so that voters and candidates’ rights are equally provided for in law across Pakistan, and for consistency with Pakistan’s international human rights commitments related to electoral participation.

- The Delimitation of the Constituencies Act 1974 should be amended, ensuring adequate protection against gerrymandering and that constituencies in FATA are approximately equal in size.

- Representation on reserved seats for women should be extended to cover FATA. ECP and NADRA should take steps to ensure registration of all eligible women in the voters list.
1. INTRODUCTION

In August 2011, the Political Parties Order (PPO) was extended to FATA, formally allowing political party activity in the region for the first time. Thus the 2013 general elections will be the first in which parties can run candidates. A number of recent moves and legal changes have shown movement towards political mainstreaming of this historically challenging region although its future status is by no means certain and politicians and FATA residents are divided on the key governance issue of whether to integrated it into Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, make it a separate province, or maintain its current semi-autonomous status. These elections take place at a time when a shift in governance may be on the political agenda in a region whose geopolitical significance is key. They also provide an opportunity to develop democratic engagement and to identify future reform activities needed.

FATA is the most underdeveloped region in Pakistan with 60% of its people living below national poverty line. Most of population depends upon subsistence agriculture with a per capita income of $250 per year which is half of the national per capita income. Scarce development funds, poor infrastructure, regional instability and decades of crisis underpinned by poor governance and weak development planning have held FATA back in terms of prosperity and development. Tribal society is paternalistic, and the marginalisation of women is reflected in their exclusion from most of public life. Socioeconomic indicators of FATA for health, access to doctors and health facilities, and education is much below the levels of other parts of the country. These disparities provide fertile ground for militancy in the name of religion.

A number of serious governance, political, legal, security, socioeconomic and administrative issues in the region present a complex and challenging environment for efforts to hold genuine elections in line with Pakistan’s international commitments. The most notable of these are the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and Elimination of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW). Pakistan ratified ICCPR in 2010 and CEDAW in 1996.

In 2008, general elections were postponed in a constituency in South Waziristan, due to on-going conflict and have still not taken place. In 2008, the security situation precluded international observers from going to FATA. FAFEN, a coalition of 30 Pakistani civil society organisations, sent observers to only four of FATA’s 12 constituencies.

The paper is based on a desk-based review of recent reform initiatives for FATA and discussions with key stakeholders in the electoral process: political parties, government officials, the Election Commission of Pakistan (ECP), FATA citizens, civil society and media representatives. Democracy Reporting International (DRI) also conducted a field study in collaboration with member organisations of the Fair and Free Election Network (FAFEN) working in FATA. The organisations which conducted the study across various parts of FATA are: Association for Creation of Employment (ACE), All Women Advancement and Resource Development (AWARD), Khwendo Kor (KK), Integrated Regional Support Programme (IRSP), Community Development Programme (CDP), United Rural Development Organisation (URDO) and Paiman.

The study was carried out in all seven agencies and FR Peshawar in August 2012. As part of the study, a randomly selected group of seven men and seven women living in FATA went through the process of obtaining Computerized National Identity Cards (CNICs) from the National Database and Registration Authority (NADRA). A separate randomly selected group of seven men and seven women, already possessing CNICs, visited their nearest ECP offices to check their status of their voter registration and applied for additions or corrections where required.

3. FATA BACKGROUND AND GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE

FATA is a territory covering some 27,224 square kilometres along the Pak-Afghan border and is the least developed region in Pakistan. It is situated between Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP) and southern Afghanistan and extends in the southwest to Balochistan.

The region is politically and administratively isolated from the rest of the country. The 1973 Constitution of Pakistan excludes FATA from the legal, judicial and parliamentary system of Pakistan, including barring the Parliament from directly legislating on FATA, and preventing its residents from bringing appeals to high courts and the Supreme Court. Unlike Pakistan’s other territories, there are no reserved seats in Parliament for women from FATA. The exclusion of FATA from the rest of the country has led to public mistrust in the capacity and will of the government to gov-

---

1 World Bank staff estimation quoted in “Post Crisis needs Assessment of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa and FATA, a joint publication of KP government, FATA Secretariat, the Asian Development Bank, European Union, United Nations and The World Bank, Published 2010, P. 25
3 NA-42, Tribal Area-VII.
5 FAFEN, Pakistan General Elections 2008: Election Day Process Analysis, p. 11
6 KP is comprised of seven divisions, each with several districts. The people of KP directly elect their provincial and national representatives and political parties are able to operate freely. The local government in KP, as in the rest of the country, is in flux. Local government elections scheduled to be held in 2009 have not yet taken place.
ern and develop the region, permitting extremists to obtain and maintain a foothold there. A large number of people from FATA temporarily live outside the territory as migrant labourers or as displaced persons.

FATA comprises seven semi-autonomous agencies and six Frontier Regions (FRs). It is located between the so-called ‘settled’ districts of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KP), i.e. those which fall within the legal set up of the rest of the country, and Afghanistan. FATA has a unique administrative structure. Constitutionally, the President of Pakistan is the chief executive for FATA. The Governor of KP, acting as the President’s representative, is responsible for administering FATA. Each agency is headed by a Political Agent (PA), who is a senior federal civil servant with far-reaching duties as executive, judge, election administrator and revenue collector. The Political Agents appoint tribal elders as maliks to help them in carrying out their duties.

The six FRs serve as a buffer zone between the agencies and the settled areas. The administrative set up is therefore a blend of what exists in the agencies and the settled areas. As in the agencies, the President has ultimate oversight of the FRs. The FRs are under the supervision of the Deputy Coordination Officer of the neighbouring settled districts in KP province, who has the powers of a Political Agent. Despite some differences, the FRs are grouped with FATA because the Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR) of 1901 applies in both areas. The Constitution also groups them together. Thus, unless otherwise specified, this assessment refers throughout to the agencies and the FRs collectively as FATA.

In addition to FATA in this part of Pakistan, there are also the Provincialy Administered Tribal Areas (PATA). These comprise the Malakand division, with its seven districts, and district Kohistan. In contrast to FATA, which are governed by the federal government, PATA is governed by the KP provincial government. In this sense, it is almost identical to the settled districts, with similar political administration and (currently suspended) elected local government. However, PATA has separate criminal and civil codes, which are more shaped by Sharia law and tribal customs.

The key distinction between the settled and tribal areas is the laws governing them. The settled areas are governed by the same legal framework as the provinces of Pakistan, whereas the tribal areas are governed by a blend of treaties concluded between the tribes and the government, tribal and Sharia law, certain codified laws and the FCR. Adult franchise was only extended to FATA in 1996. Elected representatives from FATA, 12 members in the National Assembly and 8 Senators, have no meaningful role in governing FATA as the territories are federally administered and laws do not directly apply unless specifically directed by the President. There is currently no system of elected local government in FATA. A number of other systemic problems also exist, such as the constitutionally independent ECP being substantially dependent on political agents (senior civil servants of the executive). Furthermore, because of the lack of division of powers in FATA, Political Agents (PAs) have judicial authority, thus compromising the opportunity for independent review and remedy during the election process.

### 3.1 Ministry of States and Frontier Regions (SAFRON)

The Federal Ministry of States and Frontier Regions (SAFRON) works as Presidential Secretariat for the tribal areas and is responsible mainly for issuance of policy directives for these areas. After delegation of special powers to the Governor of KP and the newly established FATA Secretariat, the power to implement developmental activities, financial powers as well as administrative control of FATA now rest with the FATA Secretariat. According to the new administrative arrangements the State and Frontier Regions Division’s responsibilities in matters related to FATA include consultation with other concerned ministries, representation of FATA administration before the National Assembly and the Senate, and liaison with the Economic Affairs Division of the Ministry of Finance and with foreign donors and lending agencies.

### 3.2 FATA Secretariat

The FATA Secretariat was established in 2002 as a dedicated structure with administrative responsibility for FATA. Five years later, in November 2007, the Civil Secretariat FATA was established to take over decision-making functions, with an Additional Chief Secretary (ACS), four secretaries and a number of directors. The Secretariat is headed by the ACS, who reports to the Governor through the KP Chief Secretary. The KP Governor Secretariat plays a coordinating role for interaction between the federal and provincial governments and the Civil Secretariat FATA. The ACS is the principal accounting officer for all FATAbudgetary allocations and all budgetary allocations, including donor funds, for FATA are released directly by the Finance Division to the FATA Secretariat. The ACS and other secretaries posted at FATA Secretariat are now authorised to correspond directly with the Federal Government Divisions. The Secretariat has been criticised for lacking capacity to coordinate large-scale development.

---

7. Khyber, Mohmand, Bajaur, Kurrum, Orakzai, North Waziristan and South Waziristan
8. FR Peshawar, FR Kohat, FR Bannu, FR Lakki Marwat, FR Dera Ismail Khan, and FR Tank
9. Article 247 of the Constitution of Pakistan
10. A Malik is the titular head of a tribe or a clan appointed, supported and paid by the administration
11. P.4, Ibid.
12. The Governor of KP promulgated the Nizam-e-Adl Regulation of 2009, providing for appointment of Qazis and restoration of the executive magistracy system in the Malakand division and district Kohistan (PATA). These regulations replaced the Sharia Nizam-e-Adl Regulations of 1999
14. P.12, Govt of Pakistan, Ministry of States and Frontier Regions: Year Book 2010-2011
17. www.fata.gov.pk; Administrative System
initiatives, having limited internal and external accountability mechanisms\(^{18}\) and for reinforcing – by its very existence – FATA's separation from the state machinery of KP\(^{19}\).

### 3.3 Political Agents

The PA is the chief administrator for a tribal agency and has historically been one of the most powerful positions in FATA. The PA is appointed by the Governor of KP and thus serves to link the President of Pakistan to the local tribal structures. As the head of all line departments for FATA the PA is involved in every aspect of the lives of FATA citizens. In addition to heading the political administration in the agency, under the FCR the PA has authority for law and order, revenue collection, planning and coordination of development activities, and judicial duties.

While the PA is still the top civilian administrator responsible for overall administration of a tribal agency, in practice the Pakistan Army has a substantial role in tribal administration. The Army's presence and fight against militants in the tribal region has changed many practices and rules. The Regulation in Aid of Civil Power in FATA, 2011, which has overriding effect, authorises the armed forces to establish security posts, conduct search operations and make arrests. The army also supervises development projects in FATA.\(^{20}\)

However, as the top civil servant, the PA still wields considerable influence and oversees the electoral process as District Returning Officer (DRO) in the agency during elections. As a DRO, the Political Agent receives nomination papers of candidates, accepts or rejects papers and is responsible for the conduct of elections in a tribal area. Challenges in accessing FATA and the lack of legal framework for independent election observation in Pakistan can make it difficult to verify the integrity of the electoral process in this region.

### 3.4 Maliks

Maliks (tribal elders) play a central role in community leadership in FATA. Some are hereditary while others are appointed by the government. Maliks assist the PA in matters of day-to-day administration, law and order, as well as tribal justice. Maliks receive allowances and privileges for these services.

Maliks historically played a key role in elections. Prior to the extension of the adult franchise in 1996, only maliks and selected nobles, often in line with the demands of their patrons in the political administration, had the right to vote in FATA. Maliks are likely to be influential in encouraging voters whether to vote or for whom, given that the tradition in FATA has been for tribes, not individuals, to decide about voting. However, the extension of the PPO into FATA could challenge the influence and privileges held by the maliks since the colonial era. Some maliks report that they were not adequately consulted on the PPO and FCR reforms which make them less likely to accept the reforms. However, other reports\(^{21}\) claim that over 300 tribal representatives were consulted on the reforms in series of forums arranged in FATA in 2008. The forums identified reform priorities which were presented to President Asif Ali Zardari in January 2009.

Maliks are, however, losing influence in tribal society. With the rise of Taliban militancy in the region, several tribal maliks have been targeted and killed. Many others have had to leave FATA because of security concerns and have settled in other parts of Pakistan. It has been argued that militant commanders have taken over much of the social role of the maliks. As an illustrative example, in January 2008, shortly before the general election, Mangal Bagh, chief of a militant group called Lashkar-e-Islam (army of Islam), promulgated an improvised election code forbidding public processes and use of vehicles, as well as display of party flags in Khyber Agency. He warned that the respective tribes of any of the candidates would be taken to task for violating it.\(^{22}\) Bagh also administered an oath on the holy Quran to candidates, wherein they swore not to sign any un-Islamic bill or support anti-country strategies; they also pledged to spend all development funds in consultation with Lashkar-e-Islam. Engagement in a democratic process may be seen as positive and increasing the chances of a peaceful election. However, preventing control of the process being taken over by non-state actors will be a considerable challenge.

---

18 For example, elected representatives from FATA do not have jurisdiction or oversight of the Secretariat.


21 Roundtable discussions arranged by Shaheed Bhutto Foundation (SBF) and National Democratic Institute (NDI). Please see http://www.ndi.org/files/Pakistan-PR-040209.pdf

22 http://www.longwarjournal.org/multimedia/Mangal-Bagh-Profile.pdf
4. FATA’S GENERAL LEGAL FRAMEWORK

4.1 Constitution of Pakistan

Upon Pakistan's independence in 1947, the special treaties that existed between the tribal areas and the British Raj ended, and Pakistan essentially continued this special relationship. Few administrative, legal or political changes have been introduced in FATA since Pakistan's independence.

Articles 246 and Articles 247 provide the framework for the relationship between FATA and the federal government. Article 246 defines the tribal areas. Under Article 247 (3), no act of Parliament is applicable to FATA or any part of it, unless directed by the President. Article 247 (5) allows the President to make rules 'for the peace and good government' of FATA or any part of it. The President has the power to abolish a tribal area in terms of clause (6) of Article 247. Under Article 247 (7) neither the Supreme Court nor any provincial high court has jurisdiction in the tribal areas unless jurisdiction is conferred on any of these courts by the Parliament through an amendment in the constitution.

Although FATA is represented in the National Assembly and Senate, the laws of Pakistan do not apply in FATA unless explicitly directed by the President. Most of Pakistan's tax laws are not extended to FATA; the political administration imposes local taxes. In some cases the people of FATA pay more taxes than people of the rest of the country (i.e. local taxes on fertilizers, wheat flour and sugar). Parliament is explicitly barred from legislating on FATA and related matters; FATA parliamentarians can legislate for rest of country but not for FATA.

Article 145 empowers the President to direct a governor of any province to act as his agent in areas in the federation which are not part of any province. For the tribal areas, the Governor of the province of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa acts as the President’s agent.

4.2 Frontier Crimes Regulation (FCR)

The Frontier Crimes Regulations (FCR), a legacy of British colonial rule, is the main instrument of governance in FATA. The justice system of FCR includes the Jirga system for adjudication of disputes. Generally, Jirga members are maliks who gets funds from the political agent and toe the line of administration in deciding cases.

FCR has been heavily criticized for denying certain key human rights. The main concerns about the FCR are unchecked powers of the Political Agents (who are at once the executive head, magistrate, session judge, de facto election administrator and revenue magistrate); denying citizens the right to present evidence, seek legal representation, or appeal. It has also been criticised for arbitrary powers of arrest and detention for security; no time limit for disposal of cases; no effective tiers of appeal/revision; no formal redress of grievances; no protection to women, children and the elderly.

One of the most problematic aspects of the FCR is the collective punishment clause, which gives the Political Agent the power to hold the entire tribe responsible for the actions of one of its members.

In August 2011, initial amendments were made to FCR to introduce, amongst other features, provision of right to bail; exemption of women, children under 16 and people over 65 from arrest or detention under collective responsibility of the tribe; additional improvements will have a positive impact on public gatherings as for construction of Hujra; prior permission of the political administration is no longer required; time limits for disposal of cases; check on arbitrary powers to arrest; enhanced revisional jurisdiction of the FATA Tribunal; vesting FATA Tribunal with powers similar to the High Court under Article 199 of the Constitution to the extent of writ of habeas corpus; and the regulation and accounting of all fines and funds.

These reforms, although a welcome step, have not gone far enough to confer basic human rights to ordinary tribesmen. There is no independent judicial mechanism to enforce fundamental rights guaranteed under the Constitution or Pakistan's international commitments under ICCPR. They do not have an independent adjudicatory forum for redress of grievances. Local administrators have full executive and judicial powers; they constitute a council of elders (Jirga) and make all decisions from arrest to conviction under the FCR. The appellate authority (Commissioner and Additional Commissioner), which hears appeals against the orders, judgments and decisions of political agents, is also part of executive.

FATA Tribunal dubbed as the High Court for FATA is under administrative control without ensured independence. The Governor of KP appoints chairman and members of the tribunal for a term of three years without tenure protection as they serve at the pleasure of the Governor. The Tribunal does not possess power of judicial review of administrative actions of the executive authorities in FATA except in case of habeas corpus. This leaves all the powers to executive officers to decide what is lawful and what is not lawful in the performance of their functions. Their exercise of authority may be subject to administrative review by their superior officers but cannot be reviewed by any independent judicial forum.

23 Neither the Pakistan Penal Code nor the Code of Criminal Procedure applies to FATA except only to a limited extent as provided in various sections and the Second Schedule of the FCR.

24 The Frontier Crimes Regulation, 1901 (III of 1901), sections 21 to 25
25 Section 11
26 Sections 21 and 21
27 This is a men’s club or guest house
28 Section 40-A
29 Section 55-A
30 producing prisoner/ detainee before a judge
32 Except in the case of habeas corpus
These long-awaited reforms are seen as a historic first step towards politically mainstreaming FATA. Effective implementation and enforcement of the reforms will require awareness and buy-in by the local population and authorities, adequate resources and monitoring, and sustained efforts to address remaining deficiencies. The upcoming general elections provide an opportunity to develop democratic engagement and to identify future reform activities needed.

While the full review of FCR is beyond the scope of this assessment, it should be noted that amendments to the FCR and the extension of PPO to FATA are the beginning of political reforms for FATA. The changes to the FCR will have a direct impact on the powers of Political Agents.

4.3 Actions in Aid of Civil Power Regulation 2011

The Actions in Aid of Civil Power Regulation 2011 was promulgated by the President of Pakistan on 27 June 2011. Its powers for the Armed Forces to suppress violent activities in FATA were made retroactive to 1 February 2008, contrary to Article 12 of the Constitution. Under its provisions, the Federal Government may requisition the Armed Forces in the defined area of FATA in aid of civil power. This defined area within FATA is delineated by the Governor of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. The Regulation gives the administration and Armed Forces operating in FATA virtually unbridled powers to act as judge, jury and executioner for anyone held on charges of terrorism.

The Regulation provides for internment or detention of any person by an Interning Authority even without specifying or communicating charges to such person as long as the Armed Forces continue to operate in the defined area. This is a sheer violation of Articles 10 and 10-A of the Constitution which provides protection against arrest or detention without due process and ensures a fair trial. Under the Regulation, any abuse by the military must be investigated by the military, and the procedure for such investigations fall severely short of international human rights standards and do not create an environment conducive for holding free and fair elections.

5. FATA’S LEGAL ELECTORAL FRAMEWORK

5.1 Political Parties Order (PPO) 2002

The PPO was finally extended to FATA on 14 August 2011, allowing for political parties to have the legal right to organise, establish their offices, and hold internal elections and field candidates for FATA constituencies in the upcoming general elections. The 12 Members of the National Assembly from FATA and 8 members of the Senate elected on party tickets from FATA will have to follow party decisions on key issues or will face disqualification under Article 63-A of the Constitution. Article 63-A empowers the head of the party to write to the ECP for disqualification of a party member if he resigns from membership of the party or joins another Parliamentary Party; votes or abstentions from voting in the House contrary to any direction issued by the Parliamentary Party to which he belongs, in relations to election of the Prime Minister or the Chief Minister, a vote of confidence or a vote of no-confidence; or a Money Bill or a Constitution (Amendment) Bill.

This extension of the PPO is consistent with Pakistan’s ICCPR obligations to provide for freedom of association.

The extension of the PPO provides political parties for the first time with formal authorization and regulation for operating in FATA. Extending the PPO into FATA may help advance the democratic agenda by countering the growth in militancy, creating space for parties to be agents of change and for citizens of FATA to participate in the democratic political process, and integrating the region into the political mainstream of the country.

5.2 Representation of People’s Act (ROPA) 1976

The Representation of the People’s Act (ROPA) 1976 was, subject to certain modifications, made applicable to FATA in 1977 by the notification of the President of Pakistan. The modifications that still stand today include:

- Allowing the ECP to delegate its powers to the PAs.
- Decision of an Election Tribunal only challengeable before the Division Bench of the Peshawar High Court and appeal to Supreme Court has been barred.
- PAs have been empowered to conduct trials of electoral offences in accordance with the provisions of FCR.

33 Actions (in Aid of Civil Power) Regulation 2011, preamble.
34 Protection against retrospective punishment.
35 ICCPR article 22. Also see See para 26 of the General Comment No. 25 of the Human Rights Committee http://www.unhchr.ch
37 Ibid Schedule, paragraph 3.
38 Ibid Schedule, paragraph 8.
39 Ibid Schedule, paragraph 11.
• Contesting candidate may submit a certificate of election expenses and supporting affidavit without specification about its format or requisite details.\textsuperscript{40}

Since policing and judiciary in FATA is also under the direct control of the PA, there is a lack of an independent electoral authority; a requirement stipulated in General Comment 25 of the ICCPR treaty monitoring body, the UN Human Rights Committee.\textsuperscript{41} Executive power is further concentrated by the PA’s authority to conduct trials of electoral offences, which precludes opportunity for independent and impartial adjudication of electoral offences. Barring the Supreme Court from hearing an appeal against any order of Peshawar High Court in a FATA election dispute reduces opportunity for remedy and is against Article 185 of the Constitution\textsuperscript{42}, which empowers the Supreme Court to hear appeals against any judgment of a high court.

5.3 Delimitation of Constituencies

The Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974, at the time of enactment, included delimitation of eight constituencies of FATA.\textsuperscript{43} This Act was amended in 2012 through the Delimitation of Constituencies (Amendment) Act 2011 in order to bring it in conformity with the Constitution, which required 12 seats for FATA for representation in the National Assembly.\textsuperscript{44}

The principles of delimitation for FATA are different from rest of Pakistan. Section 9 of the Delimitation of Constituencies Act does not contain enough safe guards against gerrymandering and inequality of votes through differentials in constituency sizes.\textsuperscript{45} In NA-47 all of six Frontier Regions (FRs), spread from Peshawar to D. I. Khan between FATA and settled districts are not interconnected, but are grouped into one constituency. This makes it difficult for candidates to effectively campaign in the whole constituency. Section 9 of the Delimitation of the Constituencies Act, 1974, says that geographical compact and contiguous areas shall be grouped in constituencies in other parts of Pakistan except FATA, thus this Act allows grouping of two or more separate areas in a constituency in FATA. The 2008 EU Election Observation Mission noted that in terms of population, FATA constituencies varied from 196,137 to 361,246. This extremely high variation in constituency sizes undermines equality of the vote, an essential component of democracy as enshrined in ICCPR article 25.

5.4 Prospects for Elected Local Government

Currently, there is no system of local government in FATA. General Musharraf introduced the FATA Local Government Election Order in 2002. A brief system of local government was introduced from 2004-2007, under which provisional agency councils were established with 70 percent of seats elected by tribal jirgas and 30 percent reserved for tribal elders, religious scholars, technocrats, and women and minorities nominated by the FATA secretariat on recommendation of political agents\textsuperscript{46}. Without support of FATA parliamentarians and political administration the system ended in 2008.

In July 2012, the FATA Secretariat prepared a draft Local Government Regulation to introduce a new local government system in FATA\textsuperscript{47}. The regulation has numerous weaknesses in the proposed electoral framework and the executive powers are a cause of concern. More importantly, it is currently unclear whether the establishment of local government is of priority for the federal government and if or when the Regulation will be enacted by the President, despite support from FATA MNAs for the local governance system in FATA. The most supportive constituency are the tribal elders and the Political Parties Joint Committee on FATA Reforms\textsuperscript{48} – they strongly support an elected local government in FATA. The most important consideration for them is that local councillors be given control over development funds.

\textsuperscript{40} Ibid Schedule, paragraph 7.

\textsuperscript{41} General Comment 25, paragraph 20.

\textsuperscript{42} Article 185 defines appellate jurisdiction of the Supreme Court to hear and determine appeals from judgments, decrees, final orders or sentences. See http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/constitution/part7/ch2.html

\textsuperscript{43} Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974, section 7(1).

\textsuperscript{44} Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, Article 51.

\textsuperscript{45} Violation of Article 25 (b) of the ICCPR which guarantees equal suffrage. Paragraph 21 of the General Comment 25 state that the drawing of electoral boundaries and the method of allocating votes should not distort the distribution of voters or discriminate against any group. For detail discussion on requirement of reforms in the Delimitation of Constituencies Act 1974, FAFEN, Election Law Reforms Project; A Unification of Pakistan’s Election Legislation including Model Provisions for Electoral Reform, June 15, 2001, 3.0 – Boundary Delimitation, 128.

\textsuperscript{46} http://www.crisisgroup.org/~/media/Files/asia/south-asia/pakistan/178_pakista_n__countering_militancy_in_fata.pdf

\textsuperscript{47} http://goo.gl/bFvnn

\textsuperscript{48} Ten political parties are represented in the Political Parties Joint Committee on FATA Reforms (FATA Committee). These are: ANP, JI, JUI-F, MQM, NP, PakMAP, PML-N, PML, PPP and QWP.
6. THE PRE-ELECTORAL ENVIRONMENT

6.1 Election Administration

The ECP is also responsible for the conduct of elections for the National Assembly and Senate in FATA. The ECP has one Agency Election Commissioner (AEC) in each FATA agency; all seven AECs report to the Regional Election Commissioner, FATA. Each AEC is assisted by one Elections Officer and three clerical officials. The six Frontier Regions are looked after by the District Election Commissioner of their neighbouring settled district. In practice the ECP appoints PAs as District Returning Officers in their respective tribal agencies. In a joint letter to the ECP in December 2012, ten political parties had recommended appointing judicial officers from neighbouring districts as election officers instead of Political Agents.49 On November 17, 2012, the National Judicial Policy Making Committee (NJPMC) decided to allow judicial officers to serve as ECP returning officers and district returning officers in the upcoming general elections. The parties demanded that to ensure equitable election administration throughout Pakistan, this decision should also apply to FATA.

With the assistance of the International Foundation for Electoral Systems (IFES), the ECP developed a five year strategic plan for 2010-2104.50 It is not clear whether the ECP consulted stakeholders from FATA in the development of the plan or if the ECP has since integrated the needs of FATA into its strategic and operational planning. The plan mentions FATA with respect to infrastructure and resources needed for all ECP divisional and district offices but does not contain any specific reflection on or recommendations for - FATA.

Stakeholders commented on the lack of a proper ECP setup in FATA, with one government official remarking that the ECP infrastructure in the region 'is in shambles.' Like other institutions in FATA, ECP offices are located in the PA's compound and the PA provides logistical support for the elections and arranges security. While the ECP claims that this arrangement has worked well, other interlocutors thought that reliance on the PA's office increases the possibility of PAs influencing the election process. Interlocutors also raised questions about the ECP's capacity to conduct electoral activities that require field presence (e.g. voter registration exercises).

6.2 Voter Registration

Originally, only Malik51 were entitled to be enrolled as voters, until the 1975 Presidential Order No. 1 was amended in 1996,52 giving the right of adult franchise to the people of FATA. In its Strategic Plan, the ECP promises to 'promote access to the registration process for all eligible voters, particularly women'.53 Remote localities, historical disenfranchisement, low voter registration and turn-out (particularly of women), and minimal political activity in FATA make running elections that reflect the will of the people very challenging. Extra measures by state authorities are needed to try to overcome participation issues, so that those elected are seen as representing the people of FATA. A crucial prerequisite is ensuring that those eligible to vote are registered to do so in the correct locality. As elsewhere in the country, the quality of the electoral roll will impact the integrity of elections and public confidence in the electoral process.

According to the population census conducted in 1998, the population of FATA was close to 3.2 million with an average annual growth rate of 2.1954. With respect to the average annual growth rate from 1998, the current population of FATA is estimated by various governmental agencies to be at nearly 4 million. More than 1.7 million voters from FATA, over 1.5 million from the agencies and the rest from the FRs, are registered in the final electoral rolls published by the ECP in July 2012.55 The number of registered male voter is 1,153,073 while female voters are 596,258. According to the electoral rolls published in August 2012, there is a 22% increase in the number of registered voters in the agencies since 2008. The total number of women voters is just over half the number of male voters in FATA56. This calls into question the universality of the franchise (an obligation under ICCPR's article 25)57.

Since the CNIC is a legal requirement for registering as a voter, the level of CNIC penetration is critical. There is a lack of detailed public information on the number of CNICs issued for residents of FATA. While men from the region commonly obtain CNICs to travel outside of FATA for work or education, women seldom do so due to tribal customs which constrain their mobility. However CNIC acquisition is on the rise in FATA.58 This is attributed to the possession of civil documentation being a requirement for identification at security check posts, receipt of relief goods, cash assistance and registration in IDP camps for residents of militancy-hit

---

49 The letter was signed by members of the Political Parties Joint Committee on FATA Reforms (FATA Committee), representing Awami National Party (ANP), Jamaat-e-Islami (JI), JamiatUlema-e-Islam F (JUI-F), Muttahida Quami Movement (MQM), National Party (NP), Pakistan Milli Awami Party (PKMAP), Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML-N), Pakistan Muslim League (PML), Pakistan People's Party (PPP) and Qaumi Watan Party (QWP).


51 A person who is in receipt of Maliki allowance or Lungi allowance or is a Mowajib Elder.

52 President’s Order No. 3 of 1996 -The Preparation of Electoral Rolls (Federally Administered Tribal Areas) (Amendment) Order, 1996 - (PLD 1997 Central Statutes 15)


54 http://www.census.gov.pk/PopulationSex.htm


56 This estimate is only for the agencies as exact data on voters in the FRs in 2008 electoral rolls could not be attained; http://www.ecp.gov.pk/VoterStats/Fata.aspx

57 ICCPR article 25 specifies that elections "shall be by universal and equal suffrage."

areas. A report by FAFEN estimates that the under-registration of eligible voters with CNICs in FATA is only 4.36 percent.59

As the electoral roll is now based on the NADRA civil registration process, the increase in CNIC acquisition in FATA means that there has been an increase in those registered to vote. Not only is it critical that people are registered to vote, they should also be registered in the right location, otherwise they may not realistically have opportunity to vote.60

No mechanism for proactive publication of the electoral rolls is stipulated in the Presidential Order No 1 (only general availability).61 There is also only a very short time (seven days) for revision entries in the electoral rolls.62 Thus there is little provision for meaningful opportunity for people to know if they are on the register and to make corrections. This raises a question about fulfilment of the ICCPR requirement for universal enfranchisement.63

The audit of the Provisional Electoral Rolls (PERs) undertaken by FAFEN in March 2012 estimated that 10-12 percent of registered voters in FATA were registered at incorrect addresses64.

Verification of voter registration information and providing accessible opportunities for correction to the electoral roll is difficult in FATA. More than 90 percent of the population of FATA reside in rural areas, located far away from public offices.65 Due to the security situation in some agencies; the Draft Electoral Rolls (DERs) and PERs had to be airlifted with the help of the army.66 Most of the applicants monitored by DRI had to travel long distances and bear high travel costs to reach ECP offices. For many applicants, travelling took up to four hours, requiring a change of up to four buses. The cost of travelling to the ECP office in the agencies was found to be between Rs. 200-1800 [1.57-14.10 euro], depending on mode of transportation and the distance travelled. In FATA, travelling long distances is particularly problematic for women, who typically must be accompanied by male family members. When travelling with women, public transportation is avoided and taxis are preferred which significantly increases travel costs. Political parties do not appear to have actively participated in the registration of voters in FATA. For example FAFEN’s observation of the display period in FATA showed that the participation of political parties during the display period67 was almost negligible, as was also the case for other parts of Pakistan68. However, as result of the three week display of electoral rolls from 29 February to 20 March 2012 and revision of the rolls, the number of FATA registered voters has increased from 1,675,967 in July 2012 to 1,749,331 in March 201369.

FAFEN’s observation of the display period of draft electoral rolls in early 2012 revealed that the voters’ accessibility to and effectiveness and efficiency of the display center staff in FATA were fairly good70. However findings from the field study revealed that, although ECP staff was available and cooperative, some ECP offices were inadequately equipped to cater to voters’ requests, thus unduly restricting opportunity to vote. For instance, some offices did not have relevant forms and voters were asked to download and print the forms themselves, an unreasonable requirement given the poor access to electricity and the internet in many agencies. The lack of female staff at ECP offices prohibits women’s access to registration and therefore to polling.71 Interlocutors indicated that there was little awareness about the display period among voters in the region. Interlocutors also noted that citizens of FATA had limited understanding of the voter registration process.

6.3 NADRA Infrastructure and Strategy for FATA

NADRA has one main office in each agency of FATA; offices for FR’s are located in their neighbouring settled districts72. In addition, there are about 16 to 18 mobile units that are available for registration in the agencies; these units are mobilised on a need basis. NADRA employs locals of the area in order to maintain a level of trust with local communities and to ease operations. NADRA reports that conservative social norms and the security situation hinders in its operations in FATA. NADRA claims that some local level offices have been shut down as a result of bomb attacks or abduction of staff.

NADRA offices have specific days reserved for female applicants only. In addition, mobile registration vans are deployed to areas that have been identified as having low CNIC registration. However, DRI field research indicates that NADRA offices in FATA do not have adequate numbers of female staff in most agencies to assist female applicants and in certain areas there are no female staff available to facilitate women on days exclusively reserved for female applicants.

The process of obtaining a CNIC in FATA differs from that in the

59 FAFEN’s estimates are based on data collected during the survey and population estimates from the Economic Survey of Pakistan, 2012. The highest incidence of under-registration of eligible voters with CNICs was documented in Sindh at 5.62%, closely followed by Balochistan (5.19%), FATA (4.36%), Punjab (2.79%), KP (2.3%) and ICT (1.65%). See FAFEN, Preliminary Electoral Rolls 2012, Accurate But Incomplete, P. 11, http://www.fafen.org/site/v5/publications/248_vla.pdf.

60 ICCPR article 25 specifies that elections “Every citizen shall have the right and the opportunity... to vote”.

61 President’s Order No. 1 of 1975; Article 3(3)

62 Ibid; Article 3(4)

63 International Covenant for Civil and Political Rights, Article 25.


66 Meeting with ECP re FATA.

67 The ECP displays draft electoral rolls for a certain period of time for public security and correction


71 This is based on study and interview with field coordinators

72 Office for Orakzai Agency is outside the agency, in district Hangu.
rest of the country. According to NADRA's registration policy, residents of FATA are required to provide some additional documentation. FATA residents must submit documentation signed by local Maliks of the applicant’s tribe, essentially verifying that the applicant is not an Afghan or member of a tribe from a different area. There is also a procedure of local certification and attestation of registration forms by PAs and Assistant PAs (APAs). In most attestation cases, arbitrary fees are charged by Maliks and the offices of PA/APAs for attestation (no official receipts are provided for the fees). Findings of the DRI Access/Field Study show that fees appear to range from Rs. 30-420 [0.24-3.30 euro]. The completion of documentation may require the applicant to make multiple visits to public offices; travelling costs and constraints in FATA add to the expenses that applicants have to bear during the registration process. It appears that in some agencies, obtaining a CNIC may take up to 40 days; whereas, according to NADRA, the maximum time for issuing of CNICs is 30 days. 

6.4 Internally Displaced Persons (IDPs)

Significant displacement in FATA began in 2008 due to conflict and military intervention against militants and still continues today. More than 90,000 families have been displaced from Kurram and Khyber agencies, and significant displacements have also occurred in Orakzai, Bajaur, Mohmand and South Waziristan agencies and FR Tank. According to the FATA Disaster Management Authority, 156,221 families have returned to their places of origin while 150,251 still reside in camps and host communities. There have been some allegations of manipulation of IDPs' votes during the 2008 elections.

Almost 46 percent of the displaced population is over 18 years of age and therefore eligible to have CNICs and register to vote. However, a 2012 Internally Displaced Persons Vulnerability Assessment and Profiling (IVAP) - an inter-agency initiative of the government, UN agencies and other national and international organisations - identified over 8,000 IDP families who possessed the older National Identity Card (NICs), which are no longer valid for voting, instead of CNICs, or had no identification at all.

Recent statistics show that 11 percent of IDP families from FATA live in IDP camps in Hangu, Nowshera and Kurram. The other 89 percent of displaced families reside with host families or in rented accommodations in other cities in KP as well as Karachi and Islamabad where there are large Pakhtun communities.

For IDP families who register in camps, only the head of the household is required to have a valid CNIC. The likelihood of IDPs having CNICs is also dependent upon their area of origin; for instance, IDPs from areas like Bara in Khyber agency may be less remote than areas in Waziristan agencies and therefore have greater access to registration services. In addition, due to social factors limiting access of women to civil documentation, there may be more female IDPs without CNICs than their male counterparts.

The humanitarian community has provided considerable support for the provision of CNICs to IDPs. NADRA has also made some effort to facilitate the provision of CNICs to IDPs through issuance of free cards and mobilisation of mobile units. However it was reported that NADRA has not been able to effectively meet the demands for mobile units at camps.

Registration of IDPs as voters at the correct location is problematic but the ECP does not seem to have a plan in place for their effective enfranchisement. The ECP claims to have carried out the verification of voters as well as display of voter rolls in IDP camps, but DRI found no supporting evidence to confirm this. The ECP also requested that SAFRON provide a ‘list of IDPs.’ It is, however, unclear what strategy was adopted to verify displaced voters who did, and more importantly those who did not, register as IDPs with the authorities. With regard to polling, there are some indications that the ECP is considering recommendations received to set up separate polling stations for IDPs in camps, but serious action in this regard is yet to be seen.

Verification of IDPs on polling day may prove to be problematic because the voter verification exercise of IDPs was seemingly inefficient. Thus some IDPs living in host communities and camps will not be able to cast their vote unless they return to where they were registered for a CNIC, which may in some cases be highly problematic. One party has requested the ECP to consider setting up separate polling stations for IDPs at camps. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa’s Provincial Disaster Management Authority (PDMA) has also asked the ECP to arrange special vote casting facility for IDPs in their respective camps. However no action in this regard has been recorded.

In general, there seems to be little concern from political parties over the registration and voting arrangements for the potentially large vote bank of displaced persons. There are no substantial

75 UNHCR, KP and FATA Statistics (As of July 2012),
77 UNHCR, KP and FATA Statistics (As of July 2012),
78 For receiving humanitarian assistance, the distinction between an NIC and CNIC obtained a CNIC may take up to 40 days; whereas, according to NADRA, the maximum time for issuing of CNICs is 30 days.
79 Significant displacement in FATA began in 2008 due to conflict and military intervention against militants and still continues today. More than 90,000 families have been displaced from Kurram and Khyber agencies and significant displacements have also occurred in Orakzai, Bajaur, Mohmand and South Waziristan agencies and FR Tank. According to the FATA Disaster Management Authority, 156,221 families have returned to their places of origin while 150,251 still reside in camps and host communities. There have been some allegations of manipulation of IDPs’ votes during the 2008 elections.
80 UNHCR, KP and FATA Statistics (As of July 2012)
82 http://complex.pakresponse.info/LinkClick.aspx?fileticket=ZKFYDqVx_uM%3d&tabid=83&mid=535
84 PTI has filed a petition for special polling stations for IDPs.
85 IDPs and related issues are discussed in greater detail in section 7.5.
86 IDPs and related issues are discussed in greater detail in section 7.5.
instances of parties actively mobilising workers to promote and facilitate CNIC and voter registration of IDPs in camps.

It is important to note that the data on displaced families, their return to areas of origin and the number of missing CNIC holders among IDPs, is either missing, insufficient and/or lacking precision. One possible reason for this is the absence of a clear framework from government authorities to deal with IDPs. Humanitarian agencies and governmental institutions involved in assisting IDPs mostly have data relating to IDPs that register in camps and not on the majority that live outside these camps. There is furthermore disagreement between NGOs and the government over the classification of IDPs. Therefore, it is difficult to assess the magnitude of the issue relating to IDPs’ participation in and access to elections. Thus there is a risk that IDPs will not have full opportunity to participate in the election, and are therefore disenfranchised and politically isolated. This also risks the representativeness of those elected being further eroded.

6.5 Voter Education

Provision of voter information is recognised by the UN Human Rights Committee to be “necessary to ensure the effective exercise” of voting rights. There is therefore an onus on the state to ensure that sufficiently effective voter education is undertaken. However, communication of electoral information is challenging in FATA for many of the reasons described above relating to security and remoteness, but also because of the very low levels of literacy. According to a survey conducted in FATA in 2009, the literacy rate of people aged 15 years and above is 22 percent; female literacy rate for the same age group was 6.7 percent.

Information gaps in FATA on electoral issues were evident during interactions with interlocutors from FATA who were generally unaware of the display period of the DERs conducted by the ECP. Currently, three state-run local radio stations operate in the region; however, these stations are not seen as fulfilling the need for producing public service information in FATA. Although some civil society activities on civic and voter education may intermittently take place in the area, these do not necessarily reach out to the majority of FATA’s rural population.

Limited political party activity in FATA also narrows this channel of electoral information for voters. It is therefore likely that voters in FATA will rely on informal channels, such as word of mouth through local clerics (who may not have adequate information themselves). Voters may also get some information via contact with family residing outside of FATA. This lack of information is likely to have a disproportionate impact on women voters in FATA as in general, men are more likely to travel outside of FATA and are more educated.

6.6 Polling

Voter turnout in FATA has typically been lower than in the rest of the country. For example in 2008, the ECP reports a FATA turnout of 31 percent. Given that a proportionally lower number of eligible adult voters were registered in FATA in 2008 compared with the other regions, the effect is that the electoral participation was much lower than the rest of Pakistan. FAFEN reports that the turnout of women voters in the country was lowest in FATA during previous elections.

During the 2008 general elections, Pakistan’s interior ministry declared all of the tribal areas’ 1,122 polling stations as sensitive and most vulnerable to suicide attacks. According to statements from former ECP senior staff, about 60-80 polling stations remained closed due to security concerns in certain areas.

In 2008, the NA election in NA-42 of South Waziristan was postponed due to security concerns and is still pending. On 16 February 2008, a suicide bomber attacked candidate’s campaign office in NA 37, Kurram Agency, killing 38 people, which led to the ECP postponing and rescheduling polling in the constituency. The ECP extended the date of filing nomination papers in three NA constituencies in FATA during the previous general elections due to the security situation in the region.

Interlocutors commented that the security situation has improved since 2008 in areas where the army has conducted operations against militants. However, law and order remains a major concern in FATA.

Accessibility of polling stations in FATA is an issue in areas with harsh terrain and where fewer government buildings are available. The logistics for transportation of materials and polling personnel is challenging and requires considerable support from the PA’s office. According to interlocutors, the ECP will need to double the number of polling stations in FATA to meet the Supreme Court requirement of providing a polling station within every two kilometres.

91 http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/default.asp?page=2008%5C02%5C01%5Cstory_1-2-2008_pg7_16
6.7 Political Party Activity

There is little public information available on political activities in FATA. While key governance issues the security conditions compromise fundamental freedoms of assembly, expression, movement and association, the question is to what extent the state authorities are taking measures to overcome these problems in order to provide maximum opportunity for political party and electoral activity. Some unconfirmed reports indicate that PAs and Pakistani armed forces have at times been a hindrance to political parties attempting to hold events in FATA. Members of Political Parties Joint Committee on FATA Reforms have also indicated that political agents, the security establishment and militants are all responsible for restricting their ability to operate freely in the region. The Committee’s one major demand is that political parties should be permitted to hold corner meetings without restrictions or advance notice.97

The KP Governor convened an advisory conference on political reform in FATA in June 201298. The conference materials indicate that political parties have held a total of 33 rallies or public gatherings since the extension of the PPO: Jammat-e-Islami (JI) has held 1699, Jamaat-e-Ulema-e-Islam (JUI-F) has held eight100, Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf (PTI) has also held eight101, and Pakistan People’s Party (PPP) has held one102. The FATA Secretariat and the Ministry of States and Frontier Regions (SAFRON) cited the same figures.

Many fear that the Taliban and other militant groups will use terror to influence the elections. These groups have killed and threatened scores of political workers and leaders in recent years. The liberal parties, in particular ANP and PPP, report that it is increasingly difficult for them to operate in the region for fear of being targeted. Even JUI-F, which has been considered ideologically close to the Taliban, has been targeted. The suicide attack on Qazi Hussain Ahmed, former amir (president) of Jamaat-e-Islami, is a clear indication that the Taliban reject all forms of democratic political and electoral activities even by religious parties in the region. Besides posing a direct security threat, militants could attempt to influence voting choices. Some interlocutors say that local commanders would tell voters (through mosque leaders) which candidates to support. The security situation will complicate preparations and likely increase costs for the elections. The political administration and the army will need to identify secure polling station locations and secure safe transportation of election materials.

The religious parties (including JUI-F and JI) are seen to have strong backing in most agencies. They have gathered support under the banner of religion, which eases their movement and access to the people. JUI-F has historically operated through the mosques and mullahs with the support of the political administration and JI has a following from conservative youth. JI and JUI-F are known for their commitment and are undertaking membership recruitment efforts. They report interest in fielding candidates throughout FATA.

Most of the political parties (including ANP, PPP, PML-Q, PML-N and QWP) have been slower to initiate party activities in FATA following the extension of the PPO. ANP in particular has highlighted security concerns as a reason for proceeding cautiously103. Some ANP leaders maintain that until the area is cleared of militants and no longer serves as a base for terrorism, it will be difficult for parties who have a declared stance against the Taliban (as ANP does), to safely and effectively conduct activities in the region.

PPP has referred to political lethargy and security threats as the main reasons that the parties have not been more active, and said that any security incident during a political rally or gathering could be used by opponents of reform to reverse the progress that has begun in the region. They reported having basic party infrastructure for FATA but also many internal vacancies.

PML reported having developed a strong party organisation throughout FATA since the extension of the PPO. They expect to field candidates in all of FATA. PML-N has been slower to initiate activities in FATA, but report that they plan to field their own candidates throughout the region. PTI appears to have garnered significant youth support in some FATA agencies, and reports an on-going membership drive.

During the meeting with the Governor of KP in October 2011, representatives of political parties agreed on formulating a code of conduct for political party activities in FATA104. However, it appears that the code was never institutionalised nor signed by the political parties.

6.8 Attitudes about Voting

Maliks interviewed reported voter apathy across different age groups. They said the key determining factor for citizens considering whether or not to vote is if an influential person contests elections or a tribal elder encourages voting. They emphasised that tribes, not individuals, decide which candidate to support and agreed the conventional belief and historic trend that woman

---

97 http://www.brecorder.com/general-news/172/1163372/
98 Similar conferences were held in the past
100 Khyber: two, Bajaur: one, Mohmand: five. Ibid.
101 Khyber: two, Bajaur: one, Mohmand: four, North Waziristan: one. Ibid.
102 Mohmand: one. Ibid.
103 More ANP members have been victims of target killings by militants than any other party.
104 Mainstream political parties met with Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Governor in Peshawar and reached consensus on a code of conduct for elections in FATA on 14 October 2011. Official version of the code is not available. Here are salient points of the code as reported in the media: ban on hate speech, including speeches against any religion; clean schools of thought or tribe; ban on displaying arms at any public meeting; ban on staging protests on roads and in bazaars. Roads and bazaars may be used for peace walks; requirement to inform agency political administration regarding the location of any public meeting. Public meetings must be held in enclosed facilities and not in the open; requirement to inform agency political administration when political leadership from outside the agency plans to participate in any public meeting; agency political administration will provide security for public meetings.
in FATA are much less likely than men to vote.

Members of civil society claim that citizens would be interested in participating in elections, if they became more educated in general and more educated about the electoral process in particular.

One could anticipate that popular demands in FATA for improved economic opportunities, basic service delivery, access to education and more importantly improved security would translate into increased participation in general elections. However, it is possible that citizens think these issues could be better addressed by local councils than by national level representatives, or that they do not have confidence that any elected representative will address these concerns at all. Furthermore, it is likely that interest and participation in elections will depend on the security situation. If areas remain under the siege of terror, the people of FATA may feel that it is only safe to support parties accepted by militants, or they may reject the political process altogether.

Interestingly, the 2011 report on Understanding FATA by the Community Appraisal and Motivation Programme (CAMP) cites a sharp decrease in support for the extension of the PPO into FATA between 2010 and 2011 (decrease from 59.7 percent to 34.9 percent) and a significant increase in respondents who do not have confidence that any elected representative will address these concerns at all. Furthermore, it is likely that interest and participation in elections will depend on the security situation. If areas remain under the siege of terror, the people of FATA may feel that it is only safe to support parties accepted by militants, or they may reject the political process altogether.

6.9 Participation of Women

In rural and conservative parts of the country, including FATA, female participation in elections tends to be very low. There are over 1.7 million voters, including 597,881 women voters, registered in FATA in the final electoral rolls published by the ECP. Women represent just over a third of registered voters in FATA and the number of men registered is almost double that of women. A number of factors impede female participation, including a lack of education/awareness, non-registration, cultural norms, active efforts to block women from voting (and little crack down on this practice by election authorities and others), and a lack of female registration and polling staff. In February 2008 ahead of the general elections, the Taliban distributed pamphlets in parts of FATA, warning to keep women away from polling stations. In Khyber agency, the local Lashkar-e-Islami leader Mangal Bagh was seen driving around the district in a convoy of 50 or 60 trucks with armed men, warning women not to vote over a loudspeaker, and announcing a shoot-to-kill policy for those who did.

There is also a lack of gender disaggregated polling data, which makes it difficult to quantify problems with women's participation. There is no a mandatory requirement for women to have photographs on their CNICs, as is required for men, so there is increased risk of impersonation of female voters. Vulnerability to fraud in female polling booths/stations is also increased by the likely lack of female observers and candidates/party agents. The failure to ensure full participation of women in FATA as voters and candidates is inconsistent with Pakistan's commitments under the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW), and therefore additional temporary special measures are required.

6.10 Observation

In 2008, due to security concerns the international observers were allowed to go to and FAFEN could send observers to only four of FATA's 12 constituencies. The UN Human Rights Committee stipulates that “there should be independent scrutiny of the voting and counting process.” Currently, there is no legal provision in Pakistan that provides for full observer access to all stages of the electoral process. Permission to observe elections is given at the discretion of the ECP. FAFEN reported that its observers were prevented from following the counting of votes in the 2008 general elections, and were denied accreditation to observe the July 2012 by-elections in Multan in Punjab province. It is not yet clear what role the PAs will play in providing approval for observation and issuing accreditation cards.

It is unclear to what extent candidates and parties will have agents in polling stations on Election Day or present during the count. This will be critical given the important role that agents play in checking the work of the election administration and thereby providing confidence in the process.

Full transparency of polling, counting and aggregation is fundamental to an accepted process and outcome. This is particularly important given the many challenges of conducting an election in FATA and the lack of confidence in the legitimacy and value of elected representatives that may be perceived by some voters. Full transparency is consistent with the ICCPR commitments.

---

105 CAMP is a local NGO in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan. See more at: http://www.camp.org.pk/about-camp.php#sthash.Y4LtxDI.dpuf
106 CAMP is a local NGO in the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (FATA) and Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Province of Pakistan - See more at: http://www.camp.org.pk/about-camp.php#sthash.Y4LtxDI.dpuf
107 Ibid.
108 According to FAFEN, the preliminary electoral roll showed a 42:100 women to men ratio of registered voters in FATA.
110 EU Election Observation Mission, Pakistan 2008, Final Report, footnote on p. 45
111 Despite photographs for women being required for passports and visas for Hajj.
112 General Comment 25, paragraph 20.
113 page 113
114 detail-ecp_disallows_fafen_from_monitoring_multan_by-polis1853
7. MEDIA AND CIVIL SOCIETY IN FATA

Pakistan's printing and publishing laws do not extend to FATA and FCR does not have any such provision. Radio is the dominant source of information in FATA in the absence of other mainstream national media. Currently there is no mechanism for the legal registration of private electronic media outlets in FATA (as the jurisdiction of Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority (PEMRA) does not extend to FATA).

Unlike the rest of Pakistan, which has seen tremendous growth in media space and pluralism following the opening up of the airwaves to private ownership over the course of the last two general elections, the absence of an electronic media licensing or regulatory authority for FATA has resulted in relative ‘information darkness.’ This media growth spurt has radically altered the political discourse and how politics is practiced in Pakistan's provinces, widening the political gulf between FATA and the country as a whole.

Due to legal, infrastructural and security issues, access to news media is fairly limited in FATA. There are only three legal local radio stations operating in FATA – in Razmak, Miranshah and Khyber. Journalism is a risky profession in FATA and 11 report- ers have been killed in the border region since 2005. A survey conducted in April and May 2012 by Intermedia, a national media support group, revealed that 74 percent of journalists had received threats during the last twelve months. As a result, a large number of journalists from FATA have been forced to relocate to other parts of the country. Many of them are forced to report on their region while staying outside FATA.

The existing native and legal media in FATA – only radio – is state-run and limited in outreach. Radio Pakistan and few other private radio channels operating from Khyber Pakhtunkhwa have licences to broadcast access to airwaves in some areas in FATA. The Pashto radio service of the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC), Deewa and Ashna radio of the Voice of America (VOA), and Radio Azadi and Mashaal Radio of the Radio Free Europe are very popular among people of the tribal areas. However, these foreign radios as well as the Radio Pakistan are not much focused on local issues and are not oriented to stimulating politics in the public sphere.

The militancy and military operations in the region have displaced hundreds of thousands of people and added a major socio-economic dimension to the regional conflict. The absence of independent, verifiable, relevant, balanced and local information results in rumours, word-of-mouth and outsider accounts of local issues that may not be representative of the situation on the ground. Despite the push for greater local political reforms through the PPO and amendments in FCR, there is no significant public-level political mobilisation to build on the opportunity of the approaching general elections and a proposed local government system for political mainstreaming.

The absence of a regulatory framework for media in FATA has created an information vacuum that is readily filled by extremist and radical groups. Towards the end of 2011, a campaign was mounted by Intermedia Pakistan to initiate debate amongst key FATA stakeholders regarding the extension of mainstream Pakistani laws to FATA and to explore additional ways to ensure the fundamental rights of freedom of expression and access to information for the people of FATA. In a roundtable in June 2012, representatives from PPP, PML-N, ANP, PML-Q and FATA MNAs and Senators adopted a declaration to help the political reforms succeed in FATA. The declaration highlights the importance of an open and local media environment that allows candidates to effectively communicate with voters.

According to the “FATA Communications Strategy Report-2009” of the FATA Secretariat, over 80 percent of adult men and over 70 percent of adult women in FATA regularly listen to radio. No local print publication is produced in FATA due to a virtual ban. Literacy rates are extremely low so not even KP-produced print media is consumed in any significant quantity. Watching TV is an expensive proposition – in terms of affordability, because militant groups discourage it and many areas in FATA have no electricity. This leaves radio as the primary medium for information in FATA. There is a need, among other things, to build on the limited media space and radio-based information for local communities to help them join the mainstream Pakistani media space and benefit from it.

7.1 Civil Society Organisations

Few Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) are present in all parts of FATA. Many are based in Peshawar and rely on a network of partner organisations and volunteers to conduct activities in FATA. CSOs reported that security and administrative hurdles are two of the biggest challenges to their work in FATA. The issues are interlinked. Civil society is under scrutiny from the political administration, intelligence community and militants. They highlighted the importance of gaining support from the local communities and power brokers, including militants, for their activities. The militants pose a particular threat if they suspect that CSOs have ulterior motives. Even with the endorsement of militants, CSOs are cautious. During the assessment period, a human rights activist working in FATA, Farida Afridi, was targeted and killed. Afridi was the co-founder of the Society for Appraisal and Women Empowerment in Rural Areas (SAWERA) — an organisation that supports the development of rural women and children in the region. The motive for her murder was appears to be simply that she was a female human rights activist working for the welfare of tribal women.
CSOs and NGOs require a Non-Objection Certificate (NOC) from the FATA Disaster Management Authority (FDMA) to carry out their work in FATA. To obtain an NOC, local organisations must register with the Social Welfare Department of FATA. Local organisations and CSOs registered with the Social Welfare Department of Khyber Pakhtunkhwa are required to submit copies of this registration and other details to the Social Welfare Department in FATA, which then issues an accreditation certificate. This accreditation certificate is also valid for applying to FDMA for an NOC to work in FATA. The NGO/INGOs have to submit a progress report each month to FDMA in a format provided by the authority. The FDMA issues the NOC only after security clearance from the 11 Corps of the Pakistan Army. CSOs reported that the requirements have become more stringent in the current security environment and that the average processing time for an NOC is two months. Any change in programme scope requires a new NOC.

8. RECOMMENDATIONS

Shortcomings remain with state agencies having taken insufficient measures to provide for full participation. To strengthen the electoral process in FATA, the institutions of state should take immediate and critical steps prior to the 2013 elections.

8.1 Security

The Government and ECP should take additional measures to ensure security of candidates, voters, polling staff and ballot papers. This could include provision of additional resources in the form of fully trained security personnel with adequate equipment at polling stations. The political administration and security forces take active steps to ensure that their personnel operate in a fully neutral manner at all times.

8.2 Support for political party activity

The Government and ECP should actively support political party and electoral activity that is conducted according to the regulatory framework. They could, for example, provide funds and channels for distribution of information, provision of additional security for meetings, provision of meeting space in public buildings, and forums to consult with and promote dialogue between parties.

8.3 Participation of women

The ECP and political administration should ensure that women are not deprived of their right to vote. The ECP should ensure the capture of gender-disaggregated information at all stages of the process in order to facilitate the development of tailored women's programmes in the future. The ECP should ensure provision of adequate numbers of well-trained and competent female returning officers and other polling staff, if necessary facilitating transport of such staff from other areas or cities, along with necessary security provisions. There should be a civic education drive tailored to women, informing them of their rights, and providing information on the registration and voting process and any support available to them in participating in the election.

8.4 Electoral Administration

ECP staff working in FATA at all levels to have targeted and ongoing training to enhance their professional capacity. ECP infrastructure, resourcing and security provision to be enhanced. Regular/real-time and complete provision of information to be provided by the ECP, FATA Secretariat and political administrations about election activities. Polling and counting is conducted with full transparency at all times. The ECP should provide information on what to do in the event that someone has a complaint.

8.5 Voter Education

Additional voter education measures to be undertaken by the ECP, the state radio stations, and civil society to emphasise the importance of individual voting rights. This could include liaison with local religious and community leaders. It should include information on voters’ rights and choices.

8.6 Media

Facilitation of free reporting by the FATA Secretariat and political administrations in agencies for journalists. Facilitation/protection by the security agencies to journalists from FATA and elsewhere covering election processes.

8.7 Observation and Scrutiny

A clear system for permission for observation and accreditation should be transparently facilitated, with full support given to observation activities. Candidates and parties should take extra measures to have well prepared polling agents present during polling, counting and results aggregation. Additional efforts are needed for coverage in women’s polling booths and stations. Civil society organisations should have maximum observer coverage, including in women’s polling stations and booths, and also of the counting and aggregation process.

8.8 Internally Displaced Persons

In consultation with community representatives and other stakeholders, the ECP should develop a plan for facilitation of voting by IDPs. This could include the provision of transportation to polling stations, an outreach programme for registration and due consideration of polling station identification.

9.1 Constitution

Articles 246 and 247 of the Constitution may be amended to bring FATA into the national mainstream and extend the jurisdiction of Parliament, the high courts, and the Supreme Court to tribal areas.

9.2 Legal framework and Governance

The legal framework should provide for basic human rights including freedoms of assembly, association and expression which are denied under the FCR. The FCR should be (if not abolished all together) revised to include a check on executive powers, particularly those of Political Agents and the collective responsibility provisions should be entirely removed. The role of Political Agent should not combine executive and judicial functions. There should be provision for the separation of powers, including requirements for an independent system to fulfill a judicial/adjudicatory function with safeguards for its independence.

9.3 Election Laws

The same set of electoral laws should apply in FATA as in the rest of Pakistan so that voters and candidates’ rights are equally provided for in law across Pakistan, and for consistency with Pakistan’s international human rights commitments related to electoral participation. There is need for an inclusive process for review of the modifications made to ROPA for its application in FATA.

9.4 Delimitation of Constituencies

Amendment of the Delimitation of the Constituencies Act 1974, to require delimitation to take place in FATA on the same basis as it does for the rest of the country, ensuring adequate protection against gerrymandering and that constituencies are approximately equal in size. A review of delimitation in FATA should be undertaken to provide for equality of the vote, for consistency within FATA constituencies and with other constituencies across Pakistan.

9.5 Participation of Women

Representation on reserved seats for women should be extended to cover FATA. Women should be required to have photographs on their CNICs. NADRA facilitate this through female registration staff and settings and an active drive to substantially increase the number of registered women voters ahead of the next electoral cycle.

9.6 Voters Access

Further measures should be taken by NADRA and the ECP to facilitate CNICs and voters being registered at the correct location for future elections. Further steps should be taken by NADRA and the ECP to promote women’s registration, including through reducing journeys required, having Mobile Registration Vans (MRVs) and the use of female registration staff. Political parties should be encouraged to take a more active approach to promoting voter registration by their supporters at the correct location.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACS</td>
<td>Additional Chief Secretary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AEC</td>
<td>Agency Election Commissioner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANP</td>
<td>Awami National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APA</td>
<td>Assistant Political Agent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNICs</td>
<td>Computerized National Identity Cards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSOs</td>
<td>Civil Society Organizations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCO</td>
<td>District Coordination Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRO</td>
<td>District Returning Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECP</td>
<td>Election Commission of Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAFE</td>
<td>Free and Fair Election Network</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FATA</td>
<td>Federally Administered Tribal Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FCR</td>
<td>Frontier Crimes Regulation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FDMA</td>
<td>FATA Disaster Management Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCPR</td>
<td>International Covenant for Civil and Political Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDPs</td>
<td>Internally Displaced Persons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFES</td>
<td>International Foundation for Electoral Systems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JI</td>
<td>Jamaat-e-Islami</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JUI-F</td>
<td>Jamiat Ulema-e-Islam (Fazl)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KP</td>
<td>Khyber Pakhtunkhwa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MMA</td>
<td>Muttahida Majlis-a-Amal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MNA</td>
<td>Member of the National Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MQM</td>
<td>Muttahida Quami Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NA</td>
<td>National Assembly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NADRA</td>
<td>National Database and Registration Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NICs</td>
<td>National Identity Cards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NOC</td>
<td>Non-Objection Certificate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NP</td>
<td>National Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PA</td>
<td>Political Agent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PATA</td>
<td>Provincially Administered Tribal Areas</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEMRA</td>
<td>Pakistan Electronic Media Regulatory Authority</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PkMAP</td>
<td>Pashtunkhwa Milli Awami Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslim League, formerly PML-Q</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PML-N</td>
<td>Pakistan Muslim League-Nawaz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPO</td>
<td>Political Parties Order, 2002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PPP</td>
<td>Pakistan People's Party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTI</td>
<td>Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>QWP</td>
<td>Quami Watan Party (formerly Pakistan Peoples Party-Sherpao)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAFRON</td>
<td>[Federal Ministry of] States and Frontier Regions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TTP</td>
<td>Tehrik-e-Taliban Pakistan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UDHR</td>
<td>Universal Declaration of Human Rights</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>